

Remarks

Claims 1-32 are cancelled. Claim 33 is currently amended. Claims 33-39 are pending.

§ 103 Rejections

Claims 22, 25-28, 30, and 31 were rejected under 35 USC § 103(a) as being unpatentable over Kovacs (US 6,206,517) in view of Waller, Jr. et al. (US 6,632,510).

Claims 22, 25-28, 30, and 31 have been cancelled rendering the above rejection moot. Accordingly, the above rejection should be withdrawn.

Allowed Claims

Claims 33-39 have been indicated as allowed if Applicants amended claim 33 to include magnesium sulfophthalate, copper sulfophthalate, zirconium sulfophthalate, and zirconium phthalate as multivalent salts. Neither Kovacs nor Waller, Jr. et al. disclose or suggest these multivalent metal salts or any salts of sulfophthalate or phthalate. Accordingly, Applicants believe that claims 33-39 as amended are allowable over the cited art of record.

In view of the above, it is submitted that the application is in condition for allowance. Reconsideration of the application is requested.

Allowance of claims 33-39, as amended, at an early date is solicited.

7 April, 2004
Date

Respectfully submitted,

By: 

Scott A. Bardell, Reg. No.: 39,594
Telephone No.: (651) 736-6935

Office of Intellectual Property Counsel
3M Innovative Properties Company
Facsimile No.: 651-736-3833